



# TORINO PROCESS 2016-17

## EGYPT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Executive summary of the Torino Process 2016–17 Egypt report.

Find the **full report on ETF Connections: Torino Process Platform Library** at:

<https://connections.etf.europa.eu/communities/service/html/communitystart?communityUuid=79f686f5-87e0-4f04-90e1-a1fa53900ca2>

The contents of this paper are the sole responsibility of the ETF and do not necessarily reflect the views of the EU institutions.

@ European Training Foundation, 2017

Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

## Acronyms

<b>ETPs</b>	Enterprise and Training Partnerships
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>EUR</b>	Euro
<b>ITEC</b>	Integrated Technical Educational Cluster
<b>LMIS</b>	Labour market information system
<b>MoETE</b>	Ministry of Education and Technical Education
<b>NAQAAE</b>	National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education
<b>NQF</b>	National Qualifications Framework
<b>PAT</b>	Professional Academy for Teachers
<b>TVET</b>	Technical and vocational education and training
<b>VET</b>	Vocational education and training
<b>WBL</b>	Work-based learning

# TORINO PROCESS 2016–17

## EGYPT

### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

#### 1. Introduction

The technical and vocational education and training (TVET) sector plays a very important role in Egypt. It covers around 50% of secondary students, it offers a higher rate of employability than higher education, and it is perceived by the majority of stakeholders and policy makers as one of the best tools for addressing unemployment. The increasing importance of the TVET sector has been confirmed in recent years by the inclusion of TVET in the new Constitution, the (unsuccessful) attempt to create a specific Ministry for TVET, and the significant financial investment by the Egyptian government in reform initiatives (e.g. EUR 67 million allocated to the European Union (EU)-supported TVET Reform Programme II, of which around EUR 12 million was released in 2016).

All key stakeholders are engaged in ambitious reforms, supported by different international partners. However, the scaling-up and sustainability of these initiatives and pilot projects within the framework of a holistic and shared vision of the TVET system remains the biggest challenge.

Recent evidence indicates that stakeholders have decided to address this challenge, and this is the most important recent development in the TVET sector. Although several tangible results have been achieved within each of the various projects, it is the recent willingness of the key TVET stakeholders to integrate these results in a national shared TVET system that is nurturing optimism for a real change of pace in reform of the TVET sector.

National stakeholders have increased their level of cooperation and have established mechanisms to ensure complementarity of the different international projects. They have also agreed on the development of a common strategy for the TVET sector, which is currently being developed by the EU-supported TVET II programme, through a participatory process in which all stakeholders are represented.

However, in order to take participatory policy decisions, a participatory assessment of the trends and challenges is needed. This is the basis of the Torino Process. TVET actors should try to invest in this or similar processes in the coming years. The Torino Process analytical tools can be revised, simplified or adapted to the Egyptian context. The periodicity of the process can vary, as can the amount of detail in the analysis. But the crucial step, and the main recommendation of the Torino Process 2016–17, is to try to establish an Egyptian-led, evidence-based, participatory process for the monitoring of TVET reform.

## 2. Main findings

### Vision and progress

TVET has gained increased importance in the education panorama during the past 10 years. Political and social factors have pushed the government to upgrade TVET to the level of inclusion in the Constitution and to take significant steps (including the nomination of a deputy minister and the creation of a ministry) to boost the idea of a holistic TVET sector with increased coordination among its main stakeholders.

The TVET sector in Egypt is composed of a multiplicity of stakeholders. All of them are strongly engaged in the reform of the sector. All of them have a vision. Unfortunately, they have not yet agreed on a common vision for the TVET sector. The unsuccessful attempts in recent years to approve a TVET strategy that is valid for the whole sector and agreed by all key stakeholders are proof of the fragmentation and instability of the sector. There is a certain degree of resistance from stakeholders to accept the leadership of one single institution over the reform of the sector. Individual strategies or strategic documents are still being developed, in the absence of an agreed common vision. The Ministry of Education and Technical Education (MoETE) has developed a medium-term plan for 2015–2018. The Ministry of Trade and Industry has developed its own strategy, which includes a chapter on TVET. The Ministry of Manpower has recently drafted a new labour law, which is currently under discussion in the parliament. Once this document is approved, the Ministry will consider it their policy reference over any new TVET strategy.

Currently, the increased scrutiny under which the TVET sector works and the efforts of the key stakeholders are creating a significant level of optimism. The overall Vision 2030, developed by the Ministry of Planning, includes a chapter on education and is acting as the overall policy reference for the new TVET strategy being developed in the context of the TVET II programme. National and international partners are making an effort to develop common standard processes, which should apply to all levels of TVET education, regardless of the governance model that is chosen at any given time. The MoETE's medium-term plan for 2015–2018 is called 'Standardisation of the TVET System'. Indeed, agreeing on common processes for issues such as curriculum development, quality assurance and accreditation would ensure better integration between the different TVET sub-sectors and an overall resilience to political and governance changes. These core processes could be the scaling-up at national level of the many cases of good practice that have been implemented at pilot level.

Although the different stakeholders have worked autonomously on different reform initiatives, some common trends can be identified in recent years:

- a shift in the policy agenda to a more employment-oriented focus (transition from school to work, career guidance);
- a reform trend leading to a more demand-oriented vision for TVET (role of the Enterprise and Training Partnerships (ETPs) as sector skills councils, provision of work-based learning);
- stakeholders and international partners working more at regional and local levels.

In the current reporting period, this trend has been demonstrated by the commitment of the stakeholders to establish effective mechanisms for skills anticipation (e.g. setting up a network of regional observatories and establishing a labour market information system (LMIS) to coordinate the information flow).

Another factor that has negatively affected the TVET sector in the past is the lack of coordination among the different international projects in the country, resulting in overlapping and contradictory

approaches. In this regard, both national stakeholders and international partners have developed a much more cooperative approach in recent years. International partners had tried to establish similar mechanisms in the past, but achieved only partial success owing to the limited ownership of the process by national stakeholders. Now the MoETE is leading the coordination, and this has been much more effective. The MoETE chairs a regular information and discussion session at which all key stakeholders and international partners are invited to present an update on the different ongoing projects in the TVET sector. This coordination mechanism started in 2016, with positive results, and efforts should be made to ensure that it becomes an institutionalised mechanism and practice.

### Effectiveness and efficiency in addressing economic and labour market demand

The TVET sector is expected to play a major role in fighting unemployment in Egypt. However, its limited relevance to labour market needs partially prevents it from doing so. Mechanisms to identify the needs of the labour market and to develop relevant qualifications exist in a variety of forms. An example is the National Skills Standards Programme (NSSP), which is owned by the Industrial Training Council. However, such mechanisms and tools are often not extended to the overall TVET sector. Their absence from many segments of the sector, combined with the increasing pace of technological and technical evolution, is having an increasingly significant impact. Successful initiatives from the past (such as the national observatory) are no longer operational, others (such as the network of regional observatories) are in the process of being implemented and have shown promising results, and new ones (such as the new LMIS system under the EU-supported TVET II programme) are being developed. Overall, the biggest challenge remains the sustainability of these mechanisms and institutions in the long term.

Employment in Egypt is facing several challenges. The country is undergoing an economic crisis that has affected employment opportunities at all levels. The number of jobs available in the private sector has decreased, in particular in the tourism sector. The fiscal crisis has also forced the government to take control of the absorption of the workforce into the public sector. National projects have been used to mitigate unemployment, but these cannot be considered a long-term solution. The demographic pressure continues to be strong, pushing significant numbers of new job seekers into the labour market every year.

The structure of the private sector, which is dominated by small and informal enterprises, is also negatively affecting the capacity of the labour market to absorb the female workforce, to create forms of cooperation with the educational sector (e.g. work-based learning) and to participate in public–private partnerships.

The ‘paradox’ of unemployment (or the phenomenon of ‘educated unemployment’) – which has been recognised for a decade as a typical feature of the Egyptian labour market – persists. Low-educated (or non-educated) workers have very low unemployment rates, while unemployment rates increase step by step with education for graduates of general and TVET secondary schools and then for post-secondary and university graduates. This indicates a clear need to revise curricula or to adapt the education and training offer to labour market needs. It also implies a need to review the national economic model, which is probably not able to generate enough high-quality jobs (requiring highly qualified workers).

The mismatch between the type and level of skills needed by the workforce and those being supplied by education and training is still significant. Egypt is facing two types of mismatches, a quantitative mismatch (incorrect distribution of students among the different sectors and levels of education) and a qualitative one (graduates who do not possess the right competences according to labour market needs).

Public authorities are aware of both issues and have included plans to address them in the different strategic documents. In practical terms, however, the main developments are taking place in the context of international projects, at pilot level, and without scaling-up to national level. In other cases,

some success stories have been institutionalised but not fully maintained over the years. The latter is the case for the Egyptian Observatory for Education, Training and Employment, which was set up in 2006, with the European Training Foundation's support, and hosted by the Egyptian Cabinet's Information and Decision Support Centre (IDSC). The Observatory was strategically and technically established to play an important independent role in addressing the knowledge gap in terms of the qualifications, skills and competences that the labour market needs. Unfortunately, political changes, a lack of funds and limited institutional back-up have prevented this body from meeting its ambitious objective. The observatory still exists in the organisational structure, but is almost inactive.

Other initiatives, such as sectoral and regional observatories, are being implemented by different actors. What these initiatives are still missing is a coordination mechanism to avoid duplication and to make sure that results are shared and used by all stakeholders. However, the improved level of cooperation among stakeholders mentioned previously in this report is starting to create the right environment for the integration of different initiatives. For example, several stakeholders are currently working to integrate regional observatories, the new LMIS being developed as part of TVET II, and the one already established in the Ministry of Trade and Industry. This is a significant improvement that addresses one of the main challenges, namely skills anticipation. The other main challenge is the missing link between the results of the analytical work done by various institutions and the policy-making function; this has direct consequences on the types of qualification offered and the number and location of TVET providers, among other aspects. Positive examples do exist, such as the proposed new qualifications developed at local level following the recommendations of the regional observatories. However, a strategic link between this phase and the core process for curriculum development has not yet been established.

The review of the process of curriculum development and the rationalisation of existing specialities is one of the top priorities for Egypt. The MoETE, through the support of the TVET II programme, has already developed a curriculum development model that has been submitted to the other stakeholders for review. However, the full curriculum development process should also reflect all the different key steps that allow the establishment of qualifications relevant for the labour market. This starts from the identification of the needs of the private sector and the development of occupational outcomes, and includes the development of qualification and assessment standards. The whole process is much wider than the responsibilities of a single unit in one ministry. It requires the involvement of a multiplicity of stakeholders, among which employer representatives should play a major role. This core process should have a national value that is agreed by all stakeholders. The key elements of this process should become the shared syntax for qualifications reform and should form the basis of other key reforms such as the National Qualifications Framework (NQF).

The MoETE is currently leading the development of such a process, in close cooperation with the Ministry of Trade and Industry and the National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAAE), and with the support of the TVET II programme. It will be important for key stakeholders to understand the need to go beyond the establishment of successful practices, which have been achieved in many projects up to now, and move to a systemic level.

A crucial role in linking TVET with the labour market should be played by the ETPs. These have been set up within the framework of the EU-supported TVET I programme in 12 strategic economic sectors to bridge the gap between employment and training provision. They have managed to remain sustainable over the years with a mixture of public funds and income generated through vocational education and training (VET) delivery. The ETPs' institutional hub has changed several times and this has prevented the definition of a clear mandate. Currently the ETPs have no income and have an unclear legal status. Around half of ETPs have run out of funds and cannot pay salaries. They have been placed under the relevant Chambers of the Federation of Egyptian Industries (with the exception of the Tourism and Construction ETPs).

An ETP management unit has been created within the Federation of Egyptian Industries to coordinate ETPs and manage requests for new ETPs. Most stakeholders are convinced that ETPs should become sector skills councils, abandoning their VET provision function to concentrate on linking VET supply and demand, ensuring the quality and relevance of qualifications, and having a role in the assessment process. The clarification of the role of the ETPs should be one of the priorities in the revision of the TVET governance model that is currently under discussion. The creation of ETPs in other economic sectors should also be considered a priority once their mandate becomes clearer and has been agreed by all stakeholders. At policy level, another important platform for dialogue between the public and private sectors is the special committee in charge of training, the development of TVET, and ETPs that has been established in the Federation of Egyptian Industries.

In addition to revising how qualifications and curricula are developed, TVET stakeholders are reforming the instruments to ensure a smooth transition from school to work, with a special focus on career guidance. In this area, reforms have been effective, and include solid plans for sustainability (e.g. the establishment of a school-to-work-transition unit in the MoETE, at regional level and in 150 schools). Another important area that needs to be further developed is the process of tracing students. Establishing a national tracer studies model is an ambitious objective, given the scale of the Egyptian TVET system, but it would provide invaluable information that could be used in the regular monitoring of the effectiveness of the TVET sector. The TVET II programme has now started to work on this topic and the results are expected in the next two years.

Entrepreneurial learning is one area in which the actions taken within different projects have not yet been scaled up at national level. For this reason, the focus of a joint initiative between the MoETE, TVET II, the Workforce Improvement and Skills Enhancement (WISE) programme, the United Nations Industrial Development Organisation (UNIDO) and Strengthening Entrepreneurship and Enterprise Development (SEED) is to move the Student Training for Entrepreneurial Promotion (STEP) model from an extra-curricular activity to an integral part of the curriculum.

### Effectiveness and efficiency in addressing demographic, social and inclusion demand

The TVET sector in Egypt is significantly bigger than those of the other countries in the region, but this is not linked to the willingness of students to select technical education as their field of study. The percentage, which is around 50%, is the result of the student tracking system: students are tracked to TVET through a ranking according to school marks (points), with the higher-performing students being allocated to general secondary education. While in most countries TVET is seen as a second choice, for many students in Egypt it is a forced choice. Increasing the attractiveness of TVET is thus a very challenging process that authorities have undertaken through policy decisions and in the context of international projects.

The most important step taken during recent years has been the opening of bridging pathways to allow VET students to access higher education. However, this decision has not led to a significant increase in the number of TVET students entering higher education. Negotiations with universities are ongoing, and a new committee formed by qualified members of the MoETE (TVET sector) and the Ministry of Higher Education has been established. Additional efforts should be made to ensure that TVET students do indeed have this opportunity, as it is crucial to increase the attractiveness of TVET in a country where accessing higher education is a huge aspiration.

The Integrated Technical Educational Clusters (ITECs) are a very interesting model of centres of competence that deliver all levels of technical and vocational qualifications in a given sector, including higher vocational education. The Education and Development Fund is trying to establish a university of technology model in line with European Universities of Applied Sciences. The Bachelor of Technology qualification delivered within the framework of ITECs is officially recognised, and discussions are now ongoing regarding the Master of Technology. The integration of this model into

the higher education framework is still under discussion. In any case, using higher education as a bait to enrol students in the TVET sector is not sufficient, and it should only be complementary to the real plan for increasing the attractiveness of the TVET sector. This should focus on increasing the quality of technical education, increasing the employability of TVET graduates and increasing career opportunities for TVET graduates through the provision of the appropriate mix of technical and soft skills. It will be important to increase the role of employers in promoting the image of the TVET sector. Any attempt to showcase TVET education that is not backed up with reassurances from employers on the future perspectives of TVET graduates has very limited potential to succeed.

The vulnerable sub-groups in Egypt are mainly women, young people and children at risk, people living in remote areas and people with disabilities. These groups are being supported by multiple initiatives at pilot level, implemented by national actors such as the Industrial Training Council or international actors such as the International Labour Organisation. Over recent years, addressing social inclusion demands has moved up the policy agenda. The most recent National Strategic Plan for Pre-University Education indicates that significant steps will be taken towards an integration policy for children with special needs. However, this policy is still at a very early stage of implementation and there is little specific reference to TVET (beyond the proper furnishing and regular maintenance of buildings). There is no dedicated action plan for targeting the needs of vulnerable groups or regions.

### Internal efficiency of the VET system

The overall efficiency of the Egyptian TVET system is low. The government is sincerely committed to improving it, and is engaged in several initiatives supported by national or international funds. Success stories are starting to emerge, but the huge scale of the TVET sector is one of the main factors preventing these changes from being quickly scaled up at system level. Other factors are the fragmentation of the system, the lack of assessment of pilot schemes, and the lack of policy decisions.

When it comes to the teaching profession, Egypt has managed to achieve change at systemic level through the introduction of the Teachers' Cadre in 2006 and the creation of the Professional Academy for Teachers (PAT) in 2008. These policy decisions have created a framework in which improvements in the teaching profession are incentivised and can be scaled up at system level relatively easily. The system does not yet work perfectly – for example, the quality standards for teachers appear to have been watered down – but it does prepare the ground for additional pedagogical reforms. Once the TVET sector finally adopts a competence model at systemic level, there will be a need for massive retraining for teachers on new pedagogic and teaching methodologies (e.g. outcome-based education, student-centred learning). Discussions are ongoing between the MoETE and PAT in this regard. PAT has already included knowledge of competence-based education as part of the standards for certifying trainers. New pedagogical approaches have been successfully tested in many pilot initiatives, but no structured attempt has so far been made to scale these up at national level. PAT was initially very active in the delivery of teacher-training activities. It is currently focusing mainly on accrediting training providers, teachers and master trainers.

The Egyptian TVET sector does not currently have a quantitative problem in relation to teachers (the student–teacher ratio is relatively low, at around nine students per teacher), but it does have a qualitative problem in terms of teachers' competences, in particular in the agricultural and commercial schools. The reasons are mainly linked to the low prestige and salary of the teaching profession.

The Egyptian government is rightly convinced that work-based learning (WBL) models could have a strong impact on increasing the relevance and efficiency of TVET. Many WBL models have been piloted and the assessment of these initiatives has mostly been positive. Some have their sustainability ensured through government funds. However, the scale of WBL in TVET is still much lower than the government would wish. According to data on 2016 from the MoETE, the current enrolment in WBL secondary education is around 2% (35 000 students in 2016). The target set by the



MoETE is an increase of 100 000 students each year in order to achieve a 50% share of students in WBL by 2025.

What is still missing is the development of a national core process that is adopted on the basis of the best practice developed through international projects. The biggest challenges in this area are the lack of a tradition of WBL, which makes it harder to convince companies of their responsibilities towards the students, and the fact that most companies in the country are small, and often informal in nature. In addition, when the regional actors have succeeded in getting a large number of companies to host students, it has been the schools that have been unable to cope with the increased intake of students, even working in triple shifts.

Special attention should be given to three original models of work-based education, which are a traditional part of the Egyptian TVET system. These are the 'productive school', the 'factory in school' and the 'school in factory' models. In the first two, the production of real goods is organised inside the schools and the students take an active part in the production. In the productive school model, the production is managed fully by school staff, while in the factory in school model, an entrepreneur sets up a production line in the school and uses students as workforce. In the school in factory model, a school is established inside a factory or farm and focuses on the specialisms required to satisfy the production needs of the factory or farm. These models are very interesting, as they are already established at national level and do not need to be scaled up. However, they are far from meeting contemporary standards in terms of WBL processes. Both models are more focused on income generation than student learning. Furthermore, the model is not a positive example of school autonomy, as the money generated is not kept by the school but is shared between the teachers and the MoETE. It appears that the ministry is interested in reviewing these models, but this will not be easy, as there are strong interests in maintaining the models as they are.

Quality assurance is one of the areas in which the government is aiming to invest more. The new Constitution of 2014 introduced a specific reference to the quality of technical education in terms of its alignment with international standards. The establishment of the National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation in Education (NAQAAE) in 2008 has provided a clear institutional hub for all initiatives and responsibilities related to quality assurance and accreditation. The accreditation procedure for TVET providers faces some complications given the huge number of providers, and the fact that accreditation is not mandatory and the procedure is cumbersome. Having passed the five-year period during which it received public funding, the NAQAAE is now self-financed, mainly through fees coming from the accreditation procedure.

The NAQAAE has designed, and is responsible for, the implementation of the NQF. In 2015, it developed a revised NQF model and presented it to all key stakeholders. This should be tested in the tourism sector, within the framework of the EU-funded TVET II programme. The NQF is comprehensive and covers the whole spectrum of TVET. Some concerns remain about the integration of different models developed over the years by different stakeholders, which refer to different international methodologies. The implementation of the NQF is directly linked to the adoption of an outcome-based methodology in the definition of qualification and assessment standards. As previously mentioned, the revision of the whole curriculum development process in this direction is in the pipeline, but the great majority of qualifications and programmes are currently still input based. While in the long term there are plans to review all qualifications, in the medium term the NAQAAE should take a policy decision on whether old qualifications should be referenced to the NQF as they are now, or whether they should first be reformulated in terms of learning outcomes.

Overall, the NAQAAE has established itself as an independent body with high-level technical competences that should remain a pillar of the upcoming systemic TVET strategy. Some concerns about its sustainability stem from the complicated accreditation process and the fact that no financial allocation is foreseen for its responsibilities in implementing the NQF.

## Governance and policy practices in the VET system

TVET in Egypt is a complicated, fragmented system with multiple stakeholders playing different roles. Some ministries, such as the MoETE, have a role in the governance and provision of one level of the system. Other ministries are involved in more than one level of TVET, for example the Ministry of Trade and Industry through the Industrial Training Council and the Productivity and Vocational Training Department, and the Ministry of Manpower. Most ministries are involved in vocational education through their own centres. Other actors play more than one role, being involved in both provision and quality assurance (ETPs).

As previously mentioned, the Egyptian TVET sector does not have its own systemic strategy. Consequently, the overall governance system is not anchored to a specific model. Over the years, this has allowed for many fluctuations in the governance of the TVET sector, often linked to changes at political level. The clearest example was the recent process of concentrating most TVET functions and institutions under a new Ministry for Technical Education and Training (2014–2015); this lasted only a few months before the functions and institutions reverted to their original positions. Greater stability could be achieved by: (1) establishing national standard processes in key VET policy areas that are formalised and do not vary depending on the evolving institutional context; and (2) developing a clear mandate for key organisations (e.g. ETPs) that can be agreed by all stakeholders and do not change in relation to where these organisations are located. The increase in the level of cooperation among key stakeholders could create an enabling environment for the recognition of a leadership role for specific actors in specific fields (e.g. MoETE for technical education).

The momentum and optimism that arose in 2014/15 has not led yet to sustainable changes, but some elements are still raising expectations for an overall improvement in the effectiveness of TVET. The TVET sector is under a great deal of political pressure, and some of the positive developments approved in 2014 are still in place (e.g. the position of Deputy Minister for Technical Education in the MoETE is still active). In addition, as previously mentioned, the MoETE's leadership in facilitating the coordination of the different international projects with the aim of ensuring complementarity and joint implementation is clearly a step in the right direction. Ideally, this coordination mechanism should be formalised within the framework of the revised governance model for the TVET sector.

The role of social partners has become stronger at sectoral level with the establishment of the ETPs, but the lack of clarity on their role and the tendency to focus on training provision is preventing them from bringing real added value in the reform and management of the TVET sector. The private sector is still too weakly represented at overall national level, where policy decisions are dominated by the public stakeholders, particularly in terms of the decision-making and advisory function. The development of the Egyptian NQF, for example, has been mainly carried out through partnership between the various ministries, while employers' organisations have not yet played a significant role.

The Egyptian TVET sector is a mixture of centralisation and decentralisation. Budgets and related TVET expenditure are completely devolved from the MoETE to each individual governorate. However, there is no form of school autonomy. Previous attempts to introduce some forms of decentralised management for TVET providers have not been scaled up, despite clear proof of their success. The size of the TVET sector in Egypt is a challenge, and only some of the TVET providers have demonstrated the competences necessary to manage their own organisation with a greater degree of autonomy. However, there are plenty of examples that could be used as models for the introduction of greater school autonomy in the system. The ITEC model, although it is still considered a pilot and it is not integrated into the formal education structure, is an interesting example of school autonomy.

### 3. Recommendations for action

#### Vision and progress

- The key stakeholders should develop a shared strategy for the reform of the TVET sector, using the Vision 2030 from the Ministry of Planning as a reference framework.
- This must be agreed by all actors, and the integration of all TVET sub-sectors should be ensured. If leadership of specific components of the reform is allocated to specific stakeholders, this should be endorsed by the authorities, and should be respected.
- The new TVET strategy should include clear links to other educational sectors (general and higher education). These links should be discussed and agreed with the relevant stakeholders. The ongoing discussions within the framework of the Egyptian NQF provide an ideal opportunity for this.
- The TVET stakeholders should focus on the development of national standard processes (curriculum development, quality assurance, accreditation, skills anticipation, among others), in parallel with the review of the governance of the system. The definition of these processes could help the progress of the TVET reform, regardless of changes at political level.
- A monitoring and evaluation function that looks at the whole TVET sector could be established through cooperation mechanisms involving the different stakeholders.

#### Effectiveness and efficiency in addressing economic and labour market demand

- TVET stakeholders should review their curriculum development process. It is crucial that this includes the labour market component (analysis of occupational profiles) and the components linked to the provision side (development of qualifications, curriculum, assessment standards, etc.). The business sector should be actively involved in the occupational analysis.
- The ETPs' mandate should be revised in order to clarify their role within the framework of overall social partner involvement in the TVET sector. An alignment of sector councils' responsibilities with international standards could be investigated. The ETPs should strengthen their role in the identification of skills needs, the quality assurance of qualifications, and the potential involvement in assessment procedures, while reducing their activity in training provision.
- The funding of the ETPs should be reviewed in order that their financial sustainability is not linked to the provision of training programmes.
- Existing efforts to establish cooperation mechanisms between the various institutions and tools in charge of skills anticipation and the monitoring of labour market trends (national observatory, network of regional observatories, the Industrial Training Council's new LMIS system, among others) should be reinforced. A clear distribution of responsibilities between the different organisations should be agreed, possibly through a formal memorandum of understanding.
- The outcomes of the analysis of labour market needs carried out by these organisations should be structurally linked to the provision side, with direct implications for the quantity and quality of qualifications offered, the locations and the providers.
- Entrepreneurial education should be integrated into technical education and training in a systematic way. This could be achieved through its integration into the curriculum as a new subject, or as a mandatory additional programme.

## Effectiveness and efficiency in addressing demographic, social and inclusion demand

- More effort should be put into the creation of effective pathways to link TVET to higher education. These should not just be a theoretical possibility but should represent a real career option for TVET graduates.
- A tracer studies system should be established in order to gather evidence on the effectiveness of TVET and to increase its attractiveness.
- The private sector should be actively engaged in the promotion of the TVET system.
- The MoETE could, in the medium term, consider a review of the system of allocating students to TVET on the basis of their grades.

## Internal efficiency of the VET system

- The share of work-based learning education at secondary level should be significantly increased.
- TVET stakeholders should build on the different past and current work-based learning initiatives to establish a national core process.
- The MoETE should take the opportunity to assess the ‘factory in school’, ‘school in factory’ and ‘productive school’ models. These should be aligned with international standards for work-based learning. At the same time, the ministry could use this opportunity to pilot models of financial decentralisation by allowing schools to retain some of the income generated.
- TVET stakeholders should address the issue of the lack of efficiency in the use of TVET resources (reduced opening hours of TVET providers, lack of regulations allowing TVET providers to sell services to the market, etc.). The ITEC model could be a source of inspiration on some of these issues.
- The MoETE should review the administrative regulations that make the operational running of TVET schools complicated and time consuming (e.g. reviewing procurement procedures).
- The MoETE should cooperate with the Professional Academy for Teachers in order to ensure that teachers are able to master the competence-based model. Teachers will have to learn to teach in a radically different way, and cannot start doing this without proper training. In the medium term, the standards for TVET teachers should include knowledge of the competence-based model.
- The government should closely monitor the proportionality between the mandate of the NAQAAE and the resources that the organisation receives to implement that mandate. A financial framework for the management and sustainability of the NQF should be put in place. If the NAQAAE is to remain responsible for it, adequate resources should be allocated.
- The NAQAAE should ensure that the private sector is strongly engaged in the development of the Egyptian NQF. In particular, the testing of the NQF at sectoral level should see employers’ organisations and the relevant ETPs in a co-leading position.

## Governance and policy practices in the VET system

- A clear multi-level governance model for the TVET sector should be established. This model should include mechanisms for cooperation at policy level but also at operational level. Regular cooperation among TVET stakeholders should happen at all levels, not only at the highest levels.
- The governance model should include the allocation of clear leadership roles to different stakeholders for different VET areas.

- Donor coordination, currently led by the MoETE, should become a formalised process.
- The process of school development should be reinforced. As a first step, a flexible framework, in which schools could benefit from increased autonomy if they fulfil selected criteria, could be approved. It is important that the new process is legislated and not piloted as a derogation to the legal framework.





# MORE INFO

To find out more about the Torino Process, compare reports, and much more, visit the Torino Process dedicated website at:

[www.torinoprocess.eu](http://www.torinoprocess.eu)

Torino Process blog: [blog.torinoprocess.eu](http://blog.torinoprocess.eu)

For information on ETF activities please visit:

[www.etf.europa.eu](http://www.etf.europa.eu)

For any additional information please contact:

European Training Foundation  
Communication Department  
Villa Gualino  
Viale Settimio Severo 65  
I – 10133 Torino

**E** [info@etf.europa.eu](mailto:info@etf.europa.eu)

**F** +39 011 630 2200

**T** +39 011 630 2222